

Nice to Meet You



Partner/Director: Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

- Practice Area: Management-Side Employment & Labor Defense; Healthcare; Municipal Law; Wage and Hour; Litigation & Appeals
- Adjunct Professor of Employment Law: UA Little Rock William H. Bowen School of Law
- More Information: <u>http://www.cgwg.com/attorneys/attorney/abtin-mehdizadegan/</u>



The Price is Wrong

 An empl benefits accident could nc

- Apparen appeare haven't : effort.
- A subse cruise d furniture

She was

LOCAL NEWS

Ex-postal worker nabbed for fraud on 'Price is Right' gets probation

Posted September 11, 2013 Updated September 12, 2013



GREENVILLE, N.C. — A former Fayetteville postal carrier who pleaded guilty to worker's compensation fraud after being spotted on "The Price is Right" game show was sentenced Wednesday to three years on probation.

sation n on-the-job ed that she

Ise when she wice. If you a great

went on a irrying

> Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

es.





Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

Halloween Costumes Gone Wrong

Woman no longer employed at hospital after blackface pic







MBTA Operator Allegedly Hired Man In Michael Myers Mask To Attack Him





More Recently . . . COVID Litigation

- Muslim man suing employer for religious discrimination
- Mosque closed and he began performing Friday prayer at work. Terminated shortly after because productivity was low. (it was low everywhere the first 2 months of COVID).
- PFG sued in New Jersey for race discrimination related to RIF. African Americans disproportionately impacted by RIF.
- Furloughed employee of 28 years sued for age discrimination where younger employees were rehired, and he was offered a severance agreement.
 - There are about 400 lawsuits of this variety currently pending.
- Several more FFCRA cases on the horizon.



More Recently . . . BLM

She wore a BLM mask to work at Whataburger. After a customer complained, she lost her job.



More Recently . . . BLM

- Side note: diversity and inclusion has taken prominence in many HR departments. *This is a wonderful thing, but* . . .
- Several opportunities for missteps.
 - Reverse discrimination suits
 - Co-opting/appropriation by disgruntled employees
 - Some company statements after George Floyd protests, while good natured, could be damning if not artfully drafted.
 - Avoid open-ended surveys at all costs.



Final Dedication									
	F								













When to Manage Risk

- At interviewing and hiring stage;
- At probation;
- Evaluation of performance;
- When things start to slip;
 - Get ahead of the issue before it becomes chronic
- When discipline is warranted.





Consider the Employee's Perspective Use Self-Evaluations

STEP 1

What is the underlying cause of the behavior? If we can catch it, can we correct it?

- Use of employee self-evaluations can be critical for success in resolving problems <u>or</u> for success in defending lawsuits.
- Is the employee unhappy in his or her current position or otherwise dealing with career development-type issues?
 - Seek to discover the employee's own desires
 - Have the employee self-assess his/her strengths



Why Do You (still) Have Problem Employees?

STEP 2

Determine your own culpability.

- Problem with your policies?
- Problem with supervision?



21



Common Policy Problems | Probation Observations - 30 days is typical, but inadequate **Probationary** Inaction results in retention - Need bodies to fill positions period is too **Recommendations** short 6 months - 30/90/180 - day evaluations Can start benefits at 30/60 days - Don't accept long-term problem as the solution to a short-term need. Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

Common Policy Problems | Attendance

Observations

- No-fault points system, or
- Standard progressive discipline
- Both have forgiveness features

Recommendations

- Address chronic absenteeism
- 6 disciplinary notices in any 24/36 month period?
- 3 suspensions will result in discharge?
- Tie benefits to straight-time hours worked?



23

Attendance

Issues







Missed Opportunities | Policies v. Directives

Not everything needs to be a policy!

 Example: before Halloween and holiday parties, a simple companywide email setting expectations (attire, alcohol consumption limits, etc.) is more than sufficient.





Why Do You (still) Have Problem Employees? If there is not a policy problem, there is probably a **supervision** problem.







Handling Problem Employees & Avoiding Legal Liability

- Understanding "pretext" arguments – McDonnell-Douglas v. Green
- Must understand legal burdens of proof and persuasion.



Pretext McDonnell-Douglas Test						
STEP 1	The employee must prove that they are a member of a protected class, that they met the employer's legitimate job expectations, that they suffered an adverse employment action (firing, demotion, etc.), and that similarly-situated employees outside the protected class were treated differently.					
STEP 2	If the employee establishes the above, the <u>employer</u> must show that its decision was made for legitimate reasons and not based on any discriminatory motivation.					
STEP 3	Cross, Gund Witherspoc Calchus, PA					

Pretext | How to Get Another Bite at the Apple

- Facts stated by employer are not true
 - Maintain proof of facts in personnel file!
- Inconsistency in application of policy
 - No good deed goes unpunished!
- Undocumented issues/discipline
 - If it's not documented, it didn't happen
- Otherwise not worthy of belief

Typical case?

Comparators (similarly-situated people <u>outside</u> the protected group) received more favorable treatment



Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

33

Case Law Example | FMLA

PLAINTIFF'S INITIAL PROOF

- Plaintiff took FMLA leave
- She was fired less than 2 days after returning to work
- No information given as to whether the employer hired another person for the job





Case Law Example | FMLA Pretext

PROOF OF PRETEXT

Plaintiff argued that the reason articulated by the employer was pretextual for three reasons:

- There was a dispute regarding whether the plaintiff denied the allegations
- The identities of the complaining patients were not disclosed in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 and therefore the testimony must be excluded
- The employer failed to apprise her of the situation until after the end of her leave.



Case Law Example | FMLA Pretext

THE COURT?

- No pretext was shown by the Plaintiff.
- However, the court did state that the law prevents illegal rather than merely erroneous or ill-advised employment decisions.
 - Was this really an ill-advised decision on the employer's part?
 - Difficult to tell. The Plaintiff likely would have sued the employer if she had been fired earlier. This is a tough call.
- The court granted summary judgment for the employer. The court held that the Plaintiff failed to show that the there was pretext, which left no genuine disputes of material fact in the suit, justifying summary judgment in the employer's favor.

Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

37

Avoiding Pretext Arguments is Key

Consistent and fair discipline of an employee and of all employees for violation of a work rule, after a full and fair investigation, having heard all sides and considered all mitigating and distinguishing factors.

- **Theft:** Difference between stealing office supplies and stealing a computer?
- Criminal Conduct: Felony aggravated assault v. marijuana possession?
- Absenteeism: Called in consistently late and received written warning v. did not call in at all and terminated?



Work Rules

- Is there a written rule?
- How was the employee informed of the written rule?
 - Important to make sure handbook is available in central worksite location and an acknowledgement of receipt is signed by the new hire.
 - Can you prove receipt?
- If the rule was not written, how was the employee informed of the rule?
- Is the rule reasonable?





Investigations

Strive for a full and fair investigation.

- Did the company make a full and complete investigation before a decision was made?
- Did the employee have the opportunity to tell his/her side of the story?
- Did the company interview witnesses suggested by the employee before the decision was made?
- Did the company reasonably consider the employee's side of the story?

41

Consistency and Fairness

Avoid pretext by comparator evidence.

- What was the discipline issued to other employees who violated this rule?
- Does the discipline in this case match the discipline in cases of other rule violations of similar severity?
- Did the company follow its progressive discipline policy?
 - If not, what was the valid reason for the exception?



Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

How to Avoid Pretext | **DOCUMENT**!

- Be fair and consistent.
- Document exceptions and reasons why.
- Make Good Facts.
- Create a paper trail. If it is not documented, it didn't happen.
- You are writing a book for the jury/judge.
- Remember that while one employee may be suing, you may need to prove that someone is not similarly-situated. This will open employment records for other non-party employees.



43

Best Practices for Documentation

- Effective documentation is:
 - Contemporaneous
 - Focused on objective, observable measures of performance
 - Avoids subjective characterizations of human behavior
- At a minimum, your documentation should include the following details:
 - The date, time, and location of a particular incident or conversation
 - The details of any conversation with the employee
 - The employment policies and procedures violated
 - Any coaching or counseling provided to the employee
 - Any disciplinary action imposed



Cross, Gunter, Witherspoon & Galchus, P.C.

Termination Discussion | Planning

- Review documentation generated through progressive discipline
- Consult with legal counsel, if appropriate
- Arrange to have the meeting in person
- Select the time and place for the meeting
- Arrange to have a manager or HR professional present as a witness
- Arrange to have the employee's physical, electronic, and financial access terminated in advance
- Arrange to have security present if the termination will pose a safety risk
- Plan ahead who is going to speak and what that person will say















Join our Private Facebook Group









Upcoming Webinars

DATE	٢	CE	WEBINAR TOPIC		SPEAKER	
September 27	20 min		Customer Service in the ASC Enhancing the Patient Experience	L	aurie Brown	
October 29	60 min	RN, CASC	Active Shooter	٦	Tonya Wagner	
November 29	20 min		Annual Survey Watch Report	١	/anessa Sindell	
December 17	60 min	RN, CASC	Credentialing Review	(Crissy Benze	
www.ProgressiveSurgicalSolutions.com/webinars						